Violence Against Women (VAW) In Azad Jammu & Kashmir (AJK) Explorations in the Role of Police department

Tahmina Rashid ^a, Khalid Chauhan ^b

^a International Studies Program , Faculty of Arts & Design, University of Canberra, Canberra, Australia.

^b Postdoctoral Research Fellow, SOAS, University of London, UK.

Corresponding authour: tahmina.rashid@canberra.edu.au

© Authour(s)

OIDA International Journal of Sustainable Development, Ontario International Development Agency, Canada ISSN 1923-6654 (print) ISSN 1923-6662 (online)

Available at http://www.ssrn.com/link/OIDA-Intl-Journal-Sustainable-Dev.html

Abstract: This Paper examines the issues around the violence against women in Azad Jammu and Kashmir (AJK) and the role of police to tackle these cases and situations. Violence against Women (VAW) is both a global concern and not merely a local problem, as violence has no geographic and socio-cultural boundaries and cuts across all socio-cultural, ethnic, geographical and class boundaries. Police is mandated to take action against VAW but it too does not take adequate steps. The central concern of this paper is that while, in all the four provinces of Pakistan, violence against women is well researched and documented, relatively little research has been conducted in the context of Azad Jammu Kashmir.

This research analyzes available literature and statistical data on crimes from AJK Police, making use of some case studies. The research concludes that women are not safe from sexual violence in the privacy of their homes, abductions emerge as the key crime in registered cases as a ploy to intimidate young women from exercising their legal right to marriage or leave homes to avoid a forced marriage. Rape crimes are linked with abductions but also crimes committed by related family members and jilted lovers. The analysis of police response highlights poor prosecution; low conviction rate; high acquittal rates; high compromise rates, and very high rate of cases pending trial in the courts. The paper further analyses the legal frameworks; institutional and societal practices and highlights the reasons for low convictions.

Keywords: Violence against women, police, AJK, laws in Pakistan

Introduction

his paper examines the issue of violence against women in Azad Jammu and Kashmir (AJK) and the role of police in tackling such violence as violence against Women (VAW) remains a global and a local concern (HRCP 2013; Grieff 2010; Hunnicutt2009; UN 1993). It is defined as '... any act of gender-based violence that results in, or is likely to result in, physical, sexual or mental harm or suffering to women, including threats of such acts, coercion or arbitrary deprivation of liberty, whether occurring in public or in private life' (UN 1993). Women are subjected to physical, sexual and psychological violence in family, community and by the state. The major forms of violence include abduction (kidnapping); murder; domestic violence; suicide; honour killing; rape (gang rape), sexual assault; acid throwing, burning and forced marriages (Aurat Foundation 2013). The Azad Jammu and Kashmir Penal Code (APC) lists the same crimes against women as are listed in the Pakistan Penal Code (PPC).

The police department is required to register FIR in case of a cognizable offence, under section 154 of the Code of Criminal Procedure¹ (CrPC 1898). Although non-registration of First Information Report (FIR) is a cause for disciplinary action, and police is accused of not registering the First Information Report easily. Sometimes cases are registered only after the media highlights the crimes but delay becomes the cause for the acquittal of the perpetrators

¹ In a non-cognizable case, under section 155 of the Code of Criminal Procedure 1898, the police are required to record the information in the Roznamzha (daily register) and refer the complainant to the magistrate.

of crime² (Dawn 2011). The police department works along similar parameters of the patriarchal society and has deeply entrenched gender bias, which mirrors social bias against women. There are also issues of accountability, capacity and lack of professionalism among the police personnel. This constitutes a state apparatus that is non-responsive to the needs of women. The central concern of this paper is that while violence against women in Pakistan is well researched and documented (HRCP 2012; Aurat Foundation 2012;HRW 1999), relatively little is known about the problem of violence against women in AJK and the response of the police. This research pioneers the examination of the issue in the context of Azad Jammu and Kashmir (AJK).

Significance of VAW in AJK

This study is important because it comes at a time when there is little research on the issue of violence against women in AJK and police response as such. The research on VAW in Pakistan has largely focused on the provinces and the Federal capital and there is hardly even a mention³ of AJK (See e.g. Aurat Foundation Reports 2012; 2010). Other research and reports have invariably looked at women's participation in institutions (Reyes 2002; Shirin M. Rai, Nafisa Shah et al. 2007), yet ignored the suffering of women in these institutions. Since no country, geography or context is immune to violence against women, which is believed to be in the household, community and even by the State; it is timely that the situation of women in Azad Kashmir must also be examined. In Pakistan too, the issue of VAW has largely been researched in the context of social customs, not crime per se (HRW 1999), Abrar and Ghouri 2010; Hamid, Johansson et al. 2010). This has resulted in an exclusive focus on cultural practices as problematic, but overlooking the role of state institutions. Still other social research finds that the situation of women emerges at the intersection of many different variables such as institutional policies and practices, the structure of organizations, the position of women in organizations, and the socio-political context (Mathur and Rajan 1997). This research intends to cover the gaps by a specific focus on AJK and the institution of police to make recommendations for tackling the problem of violence against women.

Azad Jammu and Kashmir is the Pakistan administered part of the state of Jammu and Kashmir. Its capital Muzaffarabad, it has a parliamentary form of government with a President and Prime Minister, who chairs the Council of Ministers (GOAJK 2012). The region has had parliamentary elections and government, with the exception of a six-year period from 1977 to 1983 (ibid). Almost 43 percent of AJK is forest, and only 13 percent is cultivable, with people having very small landholdings and regular outward migration⁴. For the dispensation of justice, the territory has both Supreme Court and High Court. The Azad Jammu and Kashmir Penal Code is the mere adoption of Pakistan Penal Code. As mentioned above, leading organizations such as Aurat Foundation totally omit AJK from their scope (Aurat Foundation 2012).

The Context

While there is little research and literature available on VAW in AJK, important insights can be drawn from research on the problem of VAW in the larger Pakistani context (HRW 1999). Scholars argue that in Pakistan men have always used the threat of violence, or inflicted violence as a tool to control women's lives (Mumtaz and Shaheed 1987; Abrar and Ghouri 2010; Farooq, Majeed et al. 2010; Hamid, Johansson et al. 2010). From a social perspective, the disadvantage women have from the beginning resurfaces in different forms throughout their life. To begin, life is less of a right for girls than boys, as there is still strong social preference for sons (Hussain, Fikree et al. 2000). Many parents wish for daughters only after they have two or more sons (Sarkar and Midi 2009). Society attaches less value to girls. Poverty is an issue: 'if God wants to give daughters He should give them to rich people only (Winkvist and Akhtar 2000: 17). Sons are considered to economically benefit parents but daughters are thought of as a liability due to considerations of dowry (ibid). The socio-economic considerations constitute gender bias, which permeates all institutions and is the main cause of VAW.

² In the high profile case of the rape of Mukhtaran Mai, nine years after the alleged commission of offence, the accused men were acquitted by the Supreme Court on the grounds of delay in the registration of case and inadequate police investigation.

³Aurat Foundation reports documents VAW in all the provinces of Pakistan but not in Azad Jammu Kashmir.

⁴There has been a clear pattern of migration, with people from the northern districts traditionally migrating to the Gulf countries as paid labour. From the southern districts people have migrated to the United Kingdom with most from Mirpur and Kotli Districts of Azad Jammu and Kashmir.

⁵ Amartya Sen argues that due to sex selection processes alone there are more than 'hundred million' women missing worldwide.

The officially recognized forms of VAW include murder, sexual assault, rape, abduction, acid throwing and domestic violence (Aurat Foundation 2012). The Human Rights Commission of Pakistan reports that in 2012 alone, 913 women, including 99 minors were murdered in the name of honour. Among these 604 were accused of "illicit" relationship with men and 191 had married against the wishes of their family. Almost 41 cases of acid attacks were reported in media. In 2012, from January to June, Aurat Foundation recorded 4585 cases of domestic violence (HRCP 2012: 173). HRCP recommended representation of more women in law enforcement and judiciary (ibid: 176).

The police are mandated to take cognizance of violence against women, but the performance of police is far from acceptable. More often, police appear to be favouring the accused rather than the victims. State institutions such as courts and police betray women by not prosecuting these cases. For example, in the case of Mukhtaran Mai, who was raped by the orders of the tribal council, both police and courts betrayed her and the accused were acquitted (Dawn 2011; For detail also see Supreme Court of Pakistan 2011).

Despite the enormity of the problem, the State's response has been inconsistent; Pakistan is a signatory of UN Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (UN 1979), making it obligatory for the state to take actions for the elimination of all forms of discrimination. UN General Assembly Resolution A/RES/40/34 Principle 14 requires that victims are provided '... necessary material, medical, psychological and social assistance through governmental, voluntary, community-based and indigenous means' (UN 1985). United Nations General Assembly Resolution A/RES/48/104 stipulated that states must '... exercise due diligence to prevent, investigate, and in accordance with national legislation, punish acts of violence against women' (UN 1993).

Pakistan Penal Code, Chapter XVI is about offences affecting the human body. The major offences that are committed against women include murder, Qatl-e-Amd (intentional murder section 300), Hurt (section 332), Assault (Section 351), Abduction (section 362). Rape (Section 375), it is also dealt under Enforcement of Hadood Ordinance (1979), which considers Zina (Rape) as an offence (GOP Nil). All these laws have been adopted in AJK in the form of Azad Jammu and Kashmir Penal Code.

Organization of the Paper

Section one of this paper reviews the role of police in dealing with the cases and issues related to VAW in Pakistan. Section two, presents data on VAW in Azad Kashmir and with the help of selective cases of violence against women highlights the means, methods and circumstances of violence against women. Section three discusses how VAW in Azad Kashmir largely remains unpunished and it also highlights the problems that prohibit the successful prosecution of cases. The last part of the paper presents some recommendations to tackle the issue.

Pakistan, Police & The Violence Against Women

This section will present a review of the some of the issues related to VAW and the role of police in Pakistan. Globally, police remains the first point of contact for women victims of violence (UNODC 2010). In Pakistan as per law, the police are required to register and investigate all cognizable offences (HRW 1999). Women like many other vulnerable groups feel hesitant to report to police, as there is a tendency not to believe women victims of violence, and not to register FIR or to delay its registration. There is little trust on the institution as the police fail to act even on reported cases. Some common reasons are presented in the section below.

Police-a Male Dominated Institution

Police is a male dominated institution, the gender bias reflects from its practices and attitudes towards women in general and victims of violence in particular (HRW 1999). Its members carry the whims and vagaries against women, prevalent in society. There is a general tendency among the police personnel not to believe the victim women, in cases of domestic violence or rape. There is also a tendency to consider domestic violence and assault as a private affair better settled within the four walls of family. Police considers domestic violence cases as civil not criminal offence, hence requires no intervention by police. Even in cases where interventions are made, considering it a family issues, the police routinely make attempts for reconciliation. Police are believed to author agreements between the parties, which are not legally binding. Police personnel belief that they are doing so to protect the honour of family and that the victims and their families would be better served if their women stay away from court and police stations. Among police there is a general belief that victims of domestic violence seek help but do not wish their abusive husbands to be formally charged. For the traumatized victims of violence, the interaction with police becomes an equally stressful experience. Victims feel intimidated and harassed at the hands of custodians of

law. As a result, women have no recourse to the criminal justice system, which only serves the interests of men in a patriarchal society.

Non Registration of Cases

The non-registration of cases is also due to concerns with the performance of police and down ward accountability of the officers responsible for registration of cases. Police managers gauge performance of the subordinate officers through the increase or decrease in the crime figures in the areas of jurisdiction. Any increase in the number of crimes is considered a serious performance issue. To avoid accountability on account of crime figures that would determine good or bad performance, Police personnel try to reduce the crime figures by not registering cases hence reflecting badly on their performance. That also means that the actual crime rate can go up while the non-registration of cases indicates the situation otherwise.

Police is likely to register FIR if the victim had sustained severe physical injuries, or if the civil society activists get a magisterial order instructing police to register and investigate incidents of violence. Sometimes crimes are registered on the orders of senior police officers, or the pressure from electronic media, as such news attracts public attention as well as the attention of concerned provincial governments and the higher courts. The registration of a case or First Information Report (FIR), that includes information about the name and address of the complainant; the date, time, and location of the offence; the detail of the incidence; the names of alleged perpetrator, if known; and the name of witnesses, if there are any (CPDI nd). Investigation involves collection of evidence, tracing of alleged culprits and submission of report to court for prosecution.

Defective Registration of Cases

Registration of FIR does not automatically mean justice for the victims. Sometimes FIR does not record the actual facts of the case. For example, the crimes of adultery and rape are dealt under the section 10 (2) and 10(3) of the Offence of Zina Ordinance 1979. If the police do not mention the correct section, the case will not be successfully prosecuted (HRW 1999). It has been noted that police either keeps it ambiguous or simply mentions section 10 and as such do not mention the subsection 2 or 3 as the case may be, or incorrectly noting subsection hence making the case legally ambiguous and open for interpretation later as rape or zina (adultery). Another reason is the unprofessional conduct of investigation that involves arrest of the accused, interviews of witnesses, visit of crime sites, and collection of forensic evidence from the scene of crime. When accused avoids arrest, as a tactic to delay the case, police detains the family members of the accused to pressurize the accused to hand himself over to the police.

Issues of Corruption

There is a lack of professionalism (UNODC 2012) as well as rampant corruption and lack of accountability of the police force. Police takes bribes from the complainants for the investigation of cases (HRW 1999). When the accused pays hefty bribe, the fate of the case is predetermined as the police then harasses the complainant to make amends with the accused. Often after receiving the bribe from the accused, the police take sides with them and pressurize the family members of the victims to make a compromise. Sometimes based on the oath of the accused or his family members (that the accused has not committed the crime), investigations are stopped and complainant is pressurized to stop pursuing the case (This practice is an innovation, not prescribed by law). At times, the witnesses are influenced to change their account of the crime, which affects their credibility as witness, creates inconsistencies and thus have a negative bearing on the case at the trial stage.

Contamination in Forensic Evidence

Forensic evidence is crucial in cases of violence against women, as the best of investigations and investigators cannot secure the conviction, unless forensic evidence is collected properly and timely (UNODC 2012). The cases are usually decided on the basis of forensic evidence that needs to be collected and processed in a timely and professional manner. There is always the need to make sure that the evidence is not contaminated, polluted or destroyed during the process at any stage of collection and examination. If the evidence collected from the crime scene is contaminated, the prosecution has no chance of successful conviction. The delays in transferring collected samples of evidence to the forensic science laboratories, either due to lack of transport or refrigerated facility or owing to public holiday or any disruption caused can negatively impact any case. When evidence samples require

⁶ These laws were amended in 2006 with the passage of Women's Protection bill 2006 in Pakistan, however AJK has not adopted it.

refrigeration, and the police does not have these facilities nor trained in forensic evidence collection the samples get contaminated. Such lack of training and skills in evidence collection procedures and protocols eventually benefits the accused and disadvantage the victim. The crucial evidence is also lost when the police do not arrange for a timely medico-legal examination of the victim. Often there are delays in the chemical examiner's report, either due to the workload on very few forensic examination laboratory or corruption. The Chemical Examiners do not have to testify in the court though their findings are used as exhibits in the court.

Issues of Medico-legal Examination

Medico-legal examination of the victim has a legal value, especially in cases of domestic violence, rape crimes and cases of sexual assaults. The medical examination in rape cases is critical for the successful prosecution of the accused (HRW) 1999). The courts require doctor's testimony that the penetration did occur and that it was involuntary. Medical examination is conducted by an officially designated doctor, at the referral by the police and on the orders of the magistrate. In such examination doctors look for and document signs of victim's resistance manifested in the injuries that she must have sustained. This is necessary to establish lack of consent. In case of consensual sex, under Hadood laws, the persons involved are prosecuted for crimes of adultery. It is argued that delays in the registration of FIR results in the delay of medical examination, hence a major cause of failure of prosecution. Police in general may not be trained to provide information and advice to the victims or complainant on preserving evidence, for example informing that the washing of clothes would destroy crucial evidence. Police transport is usually not available to take the victims for medical examination. The medical examination need to be conducted by a female medical officer, but there is generally shortage of such female medical officers and not all public health facilities would have a designated or trained female health professional.

When female doctors go to testify in courts there may not be any female doctor to examine victims at hospital, especially when female doctors may not be available at night. In rural areas such delay could be significant due to lack of authorized female doctors and the need to travel to district headquarters hospitals. There are no standard protocols or standard questions to be asked to the victims. Doctors are not trained to deal with the victims and there are no standardized questions or procedures that needs to be followed at the hospital. Doctors rarely ask victims to provide detail of the assault, which undermines the usefulness of such an examination. When doctors are summoned, many times they do not appear before court, to avoid responding to the hostile questions asked by the defense counsel. The defense counsel often questions the medical report; reinterpret the findings to use it to their advantage. For example, the focus on virginity or lack thereof may be used by the defense for the benefit of the accused and leads to delays, failure to prosecute or leniency in cases of violence against women.

Faulty Investigation Report

Finally in addition to the above-mentioned issues, quite often the final police investigation report (FIR) submitted to the court is deficient and full of contradictions (HRW 1999). It may not truly reflect what has happened to the victim. Statements may not be professionally recorded or may include inaccurate details. Considering the low literacy rate, the victim may not even know what is being written in her name. On behalf of accused party police sometimes even tempers with the statements given by the witnesses. Defence lawyers manipulate these discrepancies to the benefit of the accused. When victims are asked to give statement in the court of law her narration of crime conflicts with the descriptions noted in the FIR, and the benefit of the doubt favours the accused.

Extent and circumstances of VAW in AJK

In Azad Kashmir, the crimes of violence against women reported to police include murder, rape/gang rape and abduction. From 2009 till Nov 2013 a total of 697 crimes were registered all over Azad Kashmir. This included 522 cases of abduction, 99 cases of murder, 74 cases of rape/ gang rape and 2 cases of acid attack. The regional and crime wise distribution of these cases is given below.

Regional distribution of VAW

Crime statistics suggest relatively more prevalence of violence against women in Mirpur and Muzaffarabad than Rawalakot. A total of 273 incidents were reported in the Mirpur Division, 393 cases were registered in Muzaffarabad Division, and 31 cases were registered in Rawalakot Division. When the nature of these registered cases is analyzed, it appears that abductions and detaining against will makes up a large proportion of crimes against women, followed by rape/gang rape. During the studies period, a total of 522 abductions, 99 murders, 74 rape/gang

⁷Field work data collected from AJK Police

rapes and 2 acid attack incidents were reported. The spatial distribution shows relatively more occurrence of violence against women in Mirpur and Muzaffarabad than Rawalakot.

Table 1: Crime & divisional distribution of VAW (Jan 2009-Nov 2013)

Categories	Mirpur	Muzaffarabad	Rawalakot
Murder	48	24	27
William	70	24	21
Rape/ Gang rape	58	12	4
Abduction	166	356	0
Acid Attack	1	1	0
Total	273	393	31

*Source: Field work data collected from AJK Police

The Circumstances of VAW in AJK

The analysis of registered cases highlights a number of factors contributing to the vulnerability of women to violence. Women are more vulnerable to violence when they are alone in the house. On occasions sexual violence may lead to the murder of the victim to conceal the identity of the perpetrator. Family disputes between husband and wife, or between husband's relatives and wife may also result in perpetuation of violence leading to murder. Perpetrators often use hazardous material and crude tools to inflict violence. At times, woman's refusal to any advances made by an alleged lover is the motivation behind extreme violence including murder. Rape and gang rape are likely to be committed when women are alone. Sometimes women are first abducted and then raped.

The following section presents some cases to illustrate the means, methods and circumstances in which violence was perpetrated against women.

Murder Cases

VAW is more likely when women are alone both at home and in the social sphere. The case of nomad women killed in Dudyal, in District Mirpur, Azad Kashmir illustrates such vulnerability. Traditionally, in winter, nomads along with their cattle, move to warmer areas and in summer move up to the mountainous areas. Sometimes they temporarily store their household utensils with the local people during such migration. On 25th April 2013, as Mr. G was preparing to move to the Northern district of Muzaffarabad from the Southern sub division Dudyal of the Mirpur District, he noted that his wife who had gone out with the cattle has not come back. On 28th April 2013, the report of being lost was registered at the local police station, this is common for people to search at their own first before reporting the missing person to the police). On 02nd of May 2013, the decaying body of the woman was found under a local bridge. Police found out that the son of the woman (with whom Mr. G had stored his utensils) had killed her. The accused confessed that they killed the victim and later along with another accomplice raped the dead body. The police have completed the investigation and a final report has been submitted to the court on 27th June 2013.

The use of hazardous material is a common means of committing extreme forms of violence against women. This is illustrated with the case of a woman, who lived with her in-laws, was forced to drink brake oil which caused her death. As per the FIR, on 07th December 2010, Mr. Y a resident of Ban Khurman lodged a complaint with the local police that his son-in-law has murdered his daughter. His daughter S was married to Mr. Z and had a daughter of 5/6 months. Since her marriage, in last one and a half year, she was only allowed to visit her parents' house for about three times. More often Z would not allow her to go to parents' house. On 20th February 2010, Z's sister called S's father to inform him hat she was in the hospital and after an hour again called to inform him that she had passed away. The circumstances of her death were suspicious and the police started investigation under section 174 CrPC,

and a postmortem was conducted. In subsequent investigation it was found that Z made her drink brake oil, which caused her death. The break-oil was sent for chemical examination. The case is currently under trial.

In more extreme cases the perpetrators of violence use various metal or wood objects and sharp tools to harm the victim. On 30th April 2013, Mrs. R reported that her son-in-law, Mr. A called at 7 am to inform her that around 6.15 am, her daughter S had fallen off the stairs and passed away. However, she suspected that the son-in-law had hit S, in the head, with a metal rod, causing her death. The police arrested the accused, completed investigation and submitted the final report to the court. The case is currently under trial.

In another case, two victim women, both sisters, married to two brothers who were relative to them as well, told that they were severely beaten with electricity wires and not allowed to call their mother. Their paternal grandmother on an occasional visit to their home found that one of them severely injured and bruised. Their injured woman's father told that police took bribe from him but under the influence of a local politician released the accused on the same day (Key Informant interviews 2013).

Domestic disputes are another major reason for the perpetuation of violence that may lead to killing of women. In one such case, on 2nd Nov 2011, Mr. A reported that H his son in law has killed his daughter B. He told that the couple were living in the upper story of the same house and often used to fight on domestic issues. On the night at 2 am, T a neighbor came to tell him that H has called him and over the phone confessed that he had killed her wife. When both A and T, went upstairs, B was found lying dead on the bed. The police arrested the accused, recorded the statements and arranged for the postmortem. On 12, Dec 2011, upon completion of investigation police submitted the final investigation report to the concerned court.

Women are also likely to be at risk of being killed by a jilted lover. When a woman is forced to marry against her wishes in line with the family tradition or prevailing cultural practice, she may suffer violence from her in-laws or at the hands of the jilted lover. In one such case, on 3rd April 2012, , at Jatalan, N killed Ms. K with a 30 bore pistol and later killed himself with the same revolver. The statements under 161 CrPC had established the fact of the case, the case was closed and the police deemed no further action necessary.

Rape Cases

Women are likely to suffer violence at the hands of close relatives. On 15 June 2011, Mr. S resident of Billah Merra filed a complaint with the local police about the rape of his daughter. He had gone to another city for attending a funeral, during his absence his daughter was alone at home and his home alone, and was raped by a close relative. The accused absconded and the police after completion of investigation submitted final report to the court.

On 29 October 2010, her brother-in-law raped S daughter of A. S was staying with her sister for the last one year in her house. On the day of incident, her brother-in-law asked her to come to another room where her brother-in-law raped her. She was threatened that if she disclosed it to anyone, her sister will be divorced. Police arrested S, the accused and the complainant as well on suspicion of adultery. Court sentenced ten years imprisonment to S whereas S was set free. The girl claimed rape and the court set her free, while the accused brother in law was imprisoned for 10 years.

The AJK police also records cases of gang rapes, however unlike the provinces in Pakistan, where women have been gang raped at the order of the influential people, the recorded cases in AJK indicate that gang rape were committed after the abduction, not as a revenge or on the orders of the village elders. Some consider such reports as contentious and an exaggeration of the circumstances. On 01, August 2011, H reported that N and four others have raped his niece N. The victim had gone out to use the toilet (as is the practice in remote rural communities), where N held her forcibly on gunpoint, taken to a desolated place where she was gang raped by N and his accomplice. They also took photos of the accused on the mobile. The police arrested the accused, finalized the investigation and the case is at the trial stage.

In another case, on 13 Dec 2012, Mr N a relative of the victim reported to Rawalakot police that A daughter of S and F wife of S caste Mughal were abducted at gunpoint by Z and I sons of Muhammad H. Afterwards, N's relatives N and P went to the house of the accused and recovered the abducted women. On the registration of FIR, the women complained of being raped. Police arranged Medical examination, arrested the accused and recovered a pistol used during the crime. During the investigation it was found that there were four other accomplices also involved in the offence, police arrested one, while the remaining three absconded. On completion of investigation, report was submitted to the court. The case is currently under trial.

Acid Attacks

On 15th February 2012, father of S reported to police station Khori that his son-in-law S visited their house, attacked his daughter and threw acid on her causing serious facial burns. S and S had a history of domestic dispute. Police arrested the accused, submitted final investigation report to the court. The case is currently under trial. However, the police, at the time, also noted that there was no special law to file a case under the law to charge the accused for acid attack. The AJK police therefore sought promulgation of a special law on the pattern of law in force in Pakistan (For detail see Dawn2012).⁸

Compromises, Low Convictions and Pendency

The research found that during the studied period the prosecution of cases of VAW in Azad Kashmir has been abysmal. There was low conviction rate, high acquittal rates, high compromise rates and very high rate of cases pending trial in the courts. In cases of murder the conviction rate is as low as 3.6 percent; the acquittal rate is 10.8 percent; the compromise rate is 18 percent, and 68 percent cases are under trial or awaiting trial. In cases of rape/gang rape the conviction rate is as low as 1.85 percent; the acquittal rate is 9.25 percent; the compromise rate is 11.11 percent, and 70.37 percent cases are under trial or awaiting trial. In cases of abduction the conviction rate is as low as 3.98 percent; the acquittal rate is 22.10 percent; the compromise rate is 9.78 percent, and 64.13 percent cases are under trial or awaiting trial. In the last five years, there have been two cases of acid attacks and both are still under trial. The following table shows the distribution of figures of crimes against women in AJK

Table 2: Conviction-Acquittal- Compromise & Pending trial cases

Categories	No of	Conviction	Acquitted	Compromise	Pending Trial
	Incidents				
Murder	84	03(3.57 %)	09(10.71 %)	15(17.85 %	57(67.85%)
Rape/ Gang rape*	54	1(1.85%)	05(9.25 %)	06(11.11 %)	38(70.37 %)
Abduction	276	11(3.98 %)	61(22.10 %)	27(9.78 %)	177(64.13 %)
Acid Attack	02	0	0	0	02 (100 %)

^{*}Four cases of rape/ gang rape were withdrawn

The above table illustrates a trend for compromises and low conviction rates for the registered cases of VAW. The section below analyzes some cases highlighting the nature of compromises and its rationale from the perspective of police and judiciary.

Compromise-Some typical cases

Due to the triviality associated with the lives of women, the complainant and the accused, often make a compromise especially in murder cases. Regardless of different situations, in a bizarre show of apathy, invariably a woman is murdered, accused confesses the crime, police completes the investigation but the case is settled out of court due to the "forgiveness" on the part of the complainant. Paradoxically the law of Qisas & Diyat allows for such cruel dispensation of justice and the State is not even a party in prosecuting the killer or seeking justice for the murdered

⁸ In Pakistan The Criminal Law (Amendment) Act 2011(Prevention of Acid crimes incidents) Amendment in S 332 & 336 of P.P.C made act of Acid throwing an offence punishable with life imprisonment and fine of one million rupees. After the incident request was made and now this ACT has been adopted in AJK

citizen. The cases discussed below reflect how the perpetrators of heinous crime, making a mockery of the value of human life and justice system, subverting all norms of justice and humanity.

On 16th September 2010, F, a young lady resident of Khaliq Abad, District Mirpur, Azad Kashmir, who had received serious bodily injuries, was brought to District Headquarter Hospital Mirpur in a critical condition. Reportedly she was injured by her brother S, with a sharp weapon and later in the day, succumbed to the injuries and passed away. Police registered a case FIR No 188/10, under section 302 and postmortem was conducted by the female medical officer. Police recorded statements as required under section 161, arrested the accused, completed and submitted the final report (Challan) in the court of law. The court disposed off the case as father being the legal heir forgave his son for murdering his sister. Such laws (Qisas & Diyat) are often used by families of victim to forgive the accused and either accept money or settle the matter in some other ways.

On 13 July 2010, N resident of Leepa, district Hattian, Muzaffarabad Division reported that his daughter age 4/5 was killed due to a fatal head injury caused by an axe. The incident occurred when four people including Kaloo, his son, daughter and an unknown person attacked his house. The police completed investigation and on 31 August 2010, submitted report to the court. On 31 March 2013, both parties struck a compromise and the case was closed hence no further action required.

On 29 Nov 2012 M, husband of S reported to the Chikar, District Hattian Bala police that his wife was missing. He stated that he travelled to another town for work and asked his wife to go to her father's house and had informed his father-in-law. Three days later, S's uncle came to inform M (husband) that she had not reached her parents house. However, on 6thJanuary 2013, her dead body was found in Chikarlake. S's father suspected that his son-in-law had murdered his daughter and made an application to the Inspector General Police, Azad Kashmir. During the investigation, the police found that the accused had divorced his wife and informed her uncle of the divorce. The next day, accused went to Muzaffarabad but came back late at night, lured the victim to accompany him to go to district Bagh but instead took her to the lake side, strangulated her and threw into the lake. On completion of investigation, police submitted the final report to the court. On 23 October 2013, due to compromise agreed by the complainant and the accused, the court dismissed the case.

Reasons for failure of cases in courts

Based on the interviews with police and court officials, this research found the following reasons for the failure of prosecution in cases of violence against women in AJK.

False witnesses and accused

It is customary for the complainant to include the name of the people as witnesses who might never have seen the occurrence of the crime. The reasons for the murder of women could be a forced marriages, family disputes, issues of honour, and the liking disliking or affiliation of women with others, it is likely that the murder of woman happens in the house of in-laws, much away from the sight of the parents and brothers. Since from the family of in-laws, no one comes forward as a witness, it is a common practice to falsely present blood relatives as eyewitnesses. Islamic law of Qisas is invoked, which mandates death penalty but requires the evidence of at least an eyewitness who is a Muslim, a person of character, and free from moral offences. This person must have seen the incident, and could state and confirm it in the court of law. Although the blood relatives falsely presented as eyewitnesses have sympathy with the family of the victim but with the passage of time these relatives either lose interest, do not want to face the court or respond to the call of conscience and decide not to give statement before the court. This results in the failure of the case.

False reporting of time of offense

Often instead of the original time of the commission of offence, false time is reported to the police. This is done to cover delay in the registration of case. For example, a murder may have occurred at 8 am and with a time lag of fourteen hours reported to police at 10 pm. To hide the delay, the complainant may readjust time of murder. The complainant may report that at 2 pm he went to the house and saw the husband was hitting his wife with hockey sticks, which resulted in her death. These inaccuracies, however, are caught up in the post mortem report, which will establish that death had happened at 8 am and not 10 pm. In such a situation, the judges have two options a) to rely on the witness and b) to rely on the evidence of the body organs of the deceased through the post mortem report. Judges rely on the later. For them it is important that the statement of the eyewitness has not corroborated with the post-mortem report. This creates doubts that victim might have been killed in circumstances and time not known to the witness. This benefits the accused because both Islamic and common law stipulate that if there is a doubt about

the occurrence of the offence, and if it is inferred that someone else might have done or it might have been done in some other way then punishment should not be awarded.

Issues of Islamic Law

The rape cases go unpunished due to issues in the prevalent Islamic law. As per Hadood law, for the punishment of offence of rape, there is a requirement of four adult male witnesses, who fulfill the criteria of tazkiyah al-shuhood, are truthful and have not been involved in major sins, to give evidence of having seen the act of penetration as clearly as if a thread being put in the needle. This is problematic. Practically, no four persons are ever available. Nobody who commits consensual intercourse or rape will do it in front of four people. Although the requirement of four male witnesses has been revised in Women Protection ACT 2006, this has not been adopted in AJK, hence the problem continues in the protection of women in AJK.

Issues of Medico-legal report

The medico-legal examination report, in terms of establishing the circumstances, has an important evidentiary value. The report suggests approximate time of rape, and the signs of physical violence on the body of the victim. As to the process, the female doctor examines the patient, prepares report, signs and hands it over to the investigating officer. At the time of trial the same female doctor has to affirm in person⁹ her report and the victim she had examined. Female doctor are not trained as lawyers and in an open court, in the presence of the accused, the police, the judge and the male qazi, the experience is quite daunting for female doctors who need to respond to intimidating questions that require minute and accurate details. Unfortunately, this has deterred female doctors, and in order to avoid appearance before the court, it has become customary for the last ten years in Azad Kashmir, for the female doctors not to confirm rape. This has serious implications for rape victims and their compliant fails at an initial stage. If the DNA evidence is accepted as evidence by the courts the situation may change to the benefit of victims.

Cultural Context of Honour

Due to the cultural notion of honour, many rape cases go unregistered as families feel social humiliation, when the case goes public or the woman had to appear before the court. The families of the victims feel dishonored and tend not to contest such cases in court of law considering it would further jeopardize the honor of family. The accused often exerts pressure on doctor to get favorable result (negative) of medical examination, concluding that no rape occured, which results in the failure of cases. Often the witnesses retract from their original statements due to the fear and coercion by the accused, or a poor witness accepting the bribe from the accused as an incentive in lieu of their 'cooperation' in the form of a changed statement or retracting the original witness statement. Many times, the complainants are pressurized to strike a compromise with the accused, such out of court settlements, favoring the accused are negotiated by baradar is (kinship), in the name of local customs and culture, through the decisions of Panchayats (council of community elders).

Issue of Evidence Act

The Supreme Court and the High Courts have the mandate to interpret Constitution whereas the Sessions Court and the Lower Courts have no such mandate and can only literally decide cases as per the existing Laws. Since the forensic evidence such as the results of DNA analysis, have no evidentiary value under the Law of Evidence 1984, DNA evidence is not accepted as conclusive evidence by the lower courts. In compoundable offences, the complainant can enter into compromise with the accused thus the charges are dropped. As per the Islamic law, murder is a compoundable offence, and any out of court compromise is sufficient grounds for the bail. Similarly, Islamic law allows the complainant to pardon accused in the name of God, which is misused by getting money from the accused party thus allowing the rich and the mighty to make a mockery of law.

The misuse of law

The research found that often the registered cases of abduction are the cases of young girls eloping to exercise their right and marrying of their free will. Girls may leave their house of their own will and the angry parents register the cases as if she had been abducted against her will to exert pressure on the young man and his family. Courts find out

⁹ The Chemical examiners, under section 510, as experts are exempt from personal appearance before the court and their reports are considered as exhibits but medical professionals have to appear before the court to record their statements.

the truth and decide accordingly. In Rawalakot, the literacy rate among girls is much higher than boys, and girls often find themselves in a situation where potential suitors are less educated. These educated girls exercise their right to marriage and look outside their families and social networks. Young girls leave their family home willingly and appear before the magistrate in Rawalpindi, Jhelum, Chawkwal, or Lahore, testifying that they adults and are capable to make decisions, and have married of their free will and that their parents wanted to sell them in marriage with someone with whom they did not want to marry.

Reconciliation, not investigation

The frustration and economic problems in society contribute to the petty disputes in the family. It is quite common that a woman will give an application to police that her husband hit her head with stick and injured her. Police make an effort for reconciliation on the pretext of 'eastern values' and also due to the realization that the case may settle in three four months and the couple would reconcile hence the case is not worthy of their time and resources. However to console woman they use harsh words against the husband, pressurize him and get few thousand rupees bribe from him. It is only in extreme cases of grave bodily injury that the police will register the case.

Low standards of investigation

There are also concerns that the standard of investigation are very low. Police lacks the skills, training and expertise to conduct investigation, including making of crime map, collection of evidence and timely sending of material for chemical examination. Police encourages, the complainant to implicate wealthy persons to extort bribes, often on accusation of hurling threats at the complainant. Young investigating officers lack training and familiarity with operational aspects of police investigation. They lack skills to map the crime scene and the statements recorded under section 161 are mere repeat of FIR. The investigation is conducted by junior officers who are usually not aware of the Law of Evidence. The collection of evidence is not done properly. In murder cases the police does not restrict access to the crime scene that results in the destruction of crucial evidence such as footprints, blood, and items of use by the victim. Police rarely sends the blood swabs recovered from the clothes or weapons used by the accused to the serologist to establish that the blood matches with that of the victim. Such negligence has serious implication for establishing a reasonable connection between the murderer and the murdered especially when there are no eyewitnesses. The medical reports are incomplete and inconclusive, even though scientifically, it is established that after a specified time, the food eaten changes its form hence can determine the time of death. But the analysis of food in the stomach is not carried out. The law states that any recovery, which has not been secured from the scene in the presence of witnesses, has got no sanctity, is not reliable and will not be admissible in the court. The police often makes recovery of weapons such as knife, stick, and gun, in the police station, the recovered weapons are seldom secured sealed and stamped in the approved form for later presenting as exhibits in the court. When the witnesses are questioned in the court, it transpires that they had neither gone to the murderer's house, nor know about the rooms or the room from where the weapons were recovered by the police. Investigation officers avoid giving statements as witness in the court. All these factors contribute to the failure of the cases in courts.

Conclusion

Women in AJK suffer gender-based violence, in their private life, that often begins with threats and culminates in physical and sexual harm. AJK police documents major forms of violence including murder, abduction, and rape. More cases of violence against women were registered at Mirpur and Muzaffarabad Division than Rawalakot Division. Women's vulnerability to violence increases in situations where they are alone. Sometimes sexual violence results in the murder of women. Family disputes result in perpetuation of violence. Hazardous material and crude implements are used for violence. Acid attacks are rare and relatively a new phenomenon. There was low conviction rate, high acquittal rates, high compromise rates and very high rate of cases pending trial in the courts. The reasons are many and include fabricated accounts of crime and false witnesses, incorrect reporting of the time of offence, the requirements of Islamic law which in reality cannot be met, the negative medico-legal reports given by the female doctors, the tendency on the part of families not to contest cases of violence against women for fear of further dishonor to the family, the limitations of trial courts to decide as per the existing laws, and the unacceptability of DNA as an evidence, the misuse of law by the parents to report as abduction what in reality are acts of exercise of choice by women to decide about their marriage, efforts of the police for reconciliation rather than investigation, and the declining standards of investigation

Recommendations

This research presents the following recommendations to address the issues of violence against women in AJK.

Advisory service to the complainants

Police should be required to advise the families of women victims of violence to state the un-tampered facts of the case. The advisory service can be provided through the ministry of law, or the social work and women development departments at the district level. Through amendments in law, it can be made obligatory for the police to immediately notify these departments about the registration of offence against women, and the detail of the victim family. All advice must be within the ambit of law and directed towards the true statement of the facts. Local Women Organizations can assist the process as they work with these communities.

Awareness and outreach programs

There is also a need for the awareness and outreach programs to motivate the complainant to report the true time of the commission of the offence. The awareness and outreach program will help the successful prosecution of the cases. The awareness campaigns must also encourage the complainants to stand up against the perpetrators of violence so that they are brought to justice. There is a need to sensitize communities, courts and the police to encourage the victims to come forward and also to treat them with respect so that they are neither marginalized nor succumb to the pressure of tribes or political activists to strike compromise with the perpetrators in the name of honor, culture or customs.

Amendments in Laws

There is a need to revise Hadood laws and improve the Evidence Act of Azad jammu Kashmir along the lines of revisions applicable in Pakistan. Since, no four adult male witnesses, would be available to be the witness, it is recommended that the Penal Laws prevalent before the enactment of this law may be enforced with amendments in the light of best legal practices in vogue elsewhere.

Similarly, in view of the limitations of the trial courts to decide under the codified law of the land and the inadmissibility of DNA as evidence, it is important that amendment be made to make DNA as conclusive evidence. This will also offset the requirement of production of four witnesses mandatory under the Hadood Laws.

Murder is made a non-compoundable offence, an offense against the State, not to be settled out of court through offerings of money by the rich and the mighty, making the mockery of law.

Establishment of board for Medico-legal reports

In view of the practice of female doctors giving negative reports to avoid themselves from the appearance before court and the criticism of the male dominated environment in the courts, this study recommends that a board rather than one female doctor finalize medico-legal reports. This report must address all possible questions presented to them in the form of a standardized checklist. Legislation must also be done to exempt female doctors, on the pattern of chemical examiners, to appear before the court. This mechanism will result in presentation of factual Medico-Legal report before the courts and successful outcome of the cases of violence against women.

Understanding Choice of women

It is important for the families and the police, not to use law against women for the exercise of their choice. This research found that in majority of cases where women leave their house to exercise their right to a marriage of their choice, the police favours the parents to register cases of abduction of their girls. This empowers police to recover the women and prosecute the men. Under the prevalent law the police have to register case when the parents lodge complaint of the abduction of their girls. These cases need to be distinguished from the cases of abduction against a abductee's will.

Investigation, not reconciliation

This research has found that family disputes when ignored by the police may result in serious crime perpetrated against women later. These men seem to be encouraged by the de facto policy of reconciliation pursued by the police and their consideration of it as family matter. This needs to be discouraged and police be mandated to report information of such cases to the relevant office regularly and the statistics must be recorded. Streamlining of the

process of reporting and accountability of the police at the community contact level can improve the situation. The message should be clear that the primary job of the police is investigation and not be a party to such reconciliation.

Training of the police

There is an urgent need to improve the standards of investigation, by training the police with necessary skills to efficiently conduct investigation, draw crime map, collect evidence, and send the material for chemical examination in a timely manner. This research found that the young officers are in dire need of training for familiarization with practical police investigation. Training courses can be arranged both in the police training school Muzaffarabad as well as the district and divisional headquarters. The trainings must focus on how to draw crime map properly, how to collect evidence, restrict access of people to the crime scene, recover secure seal and make parcels of weapons, send swabs of blood to the serologist. They must also be familiarized about the requirements of the Evidence Act for the successful prosecution of cases.

Bibliography

- [1] Abrar, N. and A. Ghouri (2010). "The Women Violence in Pakistan: Evidence from Rural and Urban Areas." European Journal of Social Sciences 16(2): 259-266.
- [2] CPDI (nd). First Information Report (FIR) (A Guide for Citizens), Centre for Peace Development Initiatives Pakistan, available at www.cpdi-pakistan.org/?publicationAssessed on 23.11.2013
- [3] Dawn (2011) Mukhtar Mai case verdict disappoints HRCP available at http://dawn.com/news/623129/mukhtar-mai-case-verdict-disappoints-hrcp Assessed on 23 Nov 2013
- [4] Dawn (2012) Disfiguring incident in *AJK*: Tougher penalties sought for *acid attacks*www.dawn.com/.../disfiguring-incident-in-ajk-tougher-penalties-sought- Assessed on 07.01.2014
- [5] Doyle, L., Brady, A.M., and Byrne, G., (2009). "An Overview of Mixed Methods Research." <u>Journal of Research in Nursing</u> **14** (2): 175.
- [6] Farooq, U., Majeed, M., Bhatti, JA., Khan, JS., Razzak, JA., Khan, MM., and Syed, E., (2010). "Differences in Reporting of Violence and Deliberate Self Harm Related Injuries to Health and Police Authorities, Rawalpindi, Pakistan." PLoS ONE (Public Library of Science San Francisco, USA)5(2): 1-7.
- [7] GOAJK (2012). "AJK at Glance" Planning & Development Department, available on http://www.pndajk.gov.pk/glance.asp. Accessed on 14.11.2013.
- [8] (GOP Nil) Pakistan Penal Code (Act XLV of 1860) Available at http://www.pakistani.org/pakistan/legislation/1860/actXLVof1860.html Assessed on 23.11.2013
- [9] Grieff, S. (2010). "No Justics in Justification: Violence Against Women in the Name of Culture, Religion, and Tradition", The Global Campaign to Stop Killling and Stoning Women, and Women Living Under Muslim laws, available on http://www.wluml.org/sites/wluml.org/files/SKSW%20Policy%20Briefing%20Series%201 No%20Justice%20
 - http://www.wluml.org/sites/wluml.org/files/SKSW%20Policy%20Briefing%20Series%201 No%20Justice%20in%20Justifications Greiff.pdf. Assessed on 15.11.2013
- [10] Hamid, S., Johansson, Eva., Rubenson, Birgitta (2010). "Security Lies in Obedience Voices of Young Women of a Slum in Pakistan." <u>BMC Public Health</u> **10**(164): 1-7.
- [11] HRW (1999) Crime or custom?: Violence against women in Pakistan, New York: Human Rights Watch, New York
- [12] Hunnicutt, G. (2009). "Varieties of Patriarchy and Violence Against Women." <u>Violence Against Women</u>**15**(5): 553-573.
- [13] HRCP (2012). "State of Human Rights in 2012". Lahore, Human Rights Commission of Pakistan, available on http://hrcp-web.org/hrcpweb/wp-content/pdf/AR2012.pdf Assessed on 14.11. 2013.
- [14] Johnson, R. B. and A. J. Onwuegbuzie (2004). "Mixed Methods Research: A Research Paradigm Whose Time Has Come." <u>Educational Researcher</u> 33(7): 14-26.
- [15] Johnson, R. B., Onwuegbuzie, A. J., and Turner, L.A., (2007). "Toward a Definition of Mixed Methods Research." <u>Journal of Mixed Methods Research</u>1(2): 112-133.
- [16] Mathur, K. and S. Rajan (1997). "Gender Training: Potential and Limitations." <u>Indian Journal of Gender Studies</u>4(1): 67-75.
- [17] Mumtaz, K. and F. Shaheed (1987). Women of Pakistan: Two Steps Forward, One Step Back? London, Zed Books.
- [18] Ponterotto, J. G. (2005). "Qualitative Research in Counseling Psychology: A Primer on Research Paradigms and Philosophy of Science." <u>Journal of Counseling Psychology</u> **52**(2): 126-136.

- [19] Reyes, S. (2002). "Quotas for Women for Legislative Seats at the Local Level in Pakistan". Stockholm, International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance, available on http://www.idea.int/publications/wip/upload/CS_Pakistan_Reynes.pdf. Accessed on 16.11.2013.
- [20] Sandelowski, M. (2001). "Real Qualitative Researchers Do Not Count: The Use of Numbers in Qualitative Research." Research in Nursing & Health 24(3): 230-240.
- [21] Sandelowski, M. (2003). Tables or Tableaux? The Challenges of Writing and Reading Mixed Methods Studies. <u>Handbook of Mixed Mehods in Soial and Bhavioral Research</u>. Abbas Tashakkori and Charles Teddlie (eds.). California, Sage Publications: 321-350.
- [22] Shirin M. Rai, Nafisa Shah, and Aazar Ayaz (2007). Achieving Gender Equality in Public Offices in Pakistan. Islamabad, United Nations Development Programme.
- [23] Supreme Court of Pakistan (2011). "Criminal Appeals No.163 to 171 and S.M. Case No.5_2005 Mukhtar Mai Case" decided on 21.04.2011, available on http://www.supremecourt.gov.pk/web/page.asp?id=103 Assessed on 15.11.2013.
- [24] THE CODE OF CRIMINAL PROCEDURE, 1898.As amended by Act II of 1997http://www.punjabpolice.gov.pk/system/files/code-of-criminal-procedure-1898%28Amended_by_Act_II_of_1997%29.pdf
- [25] UN General Assembly (1979). "Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women" New York, United Nations, available on http://www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/cedaw/index.htm Accessed on 27.03.2011.
- [26] UN General Assembly (1985). "Declaration of Basic rinciples of Justice for victims of crime and abuse of power", General Assembly Resolution 40/34 annex, Available at http://www.un.org/documents/ga/res/40/a40r034.htm Assessed on 23.11.2013
- [27] UN General Assembly (1993,). Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against women, A/RES/48/104 Availabale at http://www.un.org/documents/ga/res/48/a48r104.htm Assessed on 23.11.2013
- [28] UNODC (2010) Handbook on Effective police responses to violence against women, Available at http://www.unodc.org/documents/justice-and-prison-reform/hb eff police responses.pdf Assessed on 23. 11. 2013
- [29] Worldatlas Explore Your World. (2013). "Latitude and Longitude Finder", available on http://www.worldatlas.com/aatlas/latitude_and_longitude_finder.htm Accessed on 14.11.2013.